The Governments of America and Rome
Document Based Question

The question is based on the accompanying documents on the following pages. This question is designed to test your ability to work with historical documents. Some of these have been edited for the purpose of this task. As you analyze the documents, take into account both the source of the document and any point of view that may be presented in the document.

Directions:
• Analyze the documents and answer the questions that follow each document.
• Read the essay question and plan your essay using the outline provided.
• Write a well-organized essay that includes an introductory paragraph, a body with several paragraphs explaining and supporting your answer, and a concluding paragraph.
• Use evidence from the documents to support your essay.
• Include specific related outside information in your essay.

Task:

For Part A, read each document carefully and answer the question or questions after each document. Then read the directions for Part B and write your essay.

For Part B, use your answers from Part A, information from the documents, and your knowledge of social studies to write a well organized essay. In the essay you will be asked to:

Describe at least three similarities between the government of the ancient Roman Republic and United States of America and conclude whether the United States Government was an experiment engineered by our Founding Fathers or a proven product of the Classical minds?
**Definitions:**

**Democracy** - government with the participation and consent of those being governed

**Republic** - government in which “the people” (however that term is defined) have an impact upon decisions

**Democratic Republic** - a republic with democratic leanings (usually this means a representative democracy – “the people” impact decisions through direct votes, and through the election of representatives who vote on many issues)

---

**Document 1:**

**An Outline of the Roman Government during the Republic:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Executive Branch</th>
<th>Legislative Branch</th>
<th>Judicial Branch</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The two leaders of the executive branch, the <em>consuls</em>, were elected for one year by the Patricians (upper class). They oversaw the Senate and commanded the Roman army during wars. Other members of the executive branch were the tax collectors, mayors, city police, and other people in positions of power in cities.</td>
<td>The most powerful part of the legislative branch was the Senate. The Senate was a group of about 300 male citizens who owned land. They could tell the consuls how much money they could spend and on what. These men were appointed by the consuls.</td>
<td>The judicial branch had six judges who were elected every two years. They were in charge of deciding punishments that criminals would receive. Their job was similar to the job that judges have today in the United States.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

A. According to Document 1, what form of government did the Roman Republic have? ______

_________________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________________

B. How was the Roman system of government arranged? __________________________

_________________________________________________________________________

_________________________________________________________________________
Document 2:

The concept of democracy, or rule by the people, was first developed by ancient Greeks. Leaders of ancient Rome continued that development. Roman men were citizens who could vote for people to represent them. A ruling body, called a Senate, was run by powerful people. Less powerful citizens were given the right to veto or stop an action of the Senate. In these ways, all citizens had a say in the government.

“Let them enjoy indeed the title of citizens.”
—Emperor Claudius, as recorded by Tacitus, A.D. 48

1. What rights did Roman men enjoy as citizens?

______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________

Document 3:

- All free people have equal rights before the law.
- A person must be considered innocent until he or she is proven guilty.
- Accused people should be allowed to face their accusers and defend themselves.
- Judges must interpret the law and make decisions fairly.
- People have rights that no government can take away.

The ancient Roman Empire covered a huge area and included many groups of people. To rule such a large area, the Romans created a code of laws that many nations still use today. What follows are some principles, or basic rules, that the Romans developed.

1. Which principle prevents a government from becoming too powerful? ______________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________

2. Which principle prevents someone from going to jail based on a rumor that he or she committed a crime? ______________________
______________________________________________________________________________
Document 4:

The first ten Amendments to the United States Constitution from the Bill of Rights for American citizens:

1. Freedom of speech, press and religion
2. Right to keep and bear arms
3. Freedom from housing soldiers in private homes
4. Freedom from unreasonable search and seizure
5. Right to process - innocent until proven guilty
6. Right to a speedy and public trial
7. Civil trial by jury
8. Freedom from cruel and unusual punishment
10. Limits the power of the Federal Government to those granted in the Constitution

1. List the Similarities that you find in the Twelve Tables and the Bill of Rights:

______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________

2. List the differences that you find in the Twelve Tables and the Bill of Rights:

______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
Document 5:

As we know from the myth of Romulus and Remus, the original community of Rome was founded in 753 BCE. In the late 600’s BCE, Romans were ruled by the Etruscans. The Etruscans were the people who lived north of Rome in central Italy. These northern Italians were highly skilled artisans who knew how to pave roads, drain marshes, and construct sewers. They were also under the control of a monarch.

In 509 BCE wealthy Roman landowners overthrew the Etruscan king and vowed never to be ruled by a monarch again. In place of the monarchy, the Romans established a republic (a thing of the people). A republic is a form of government in which voters elect officials to run the state. In the Roman Republic, only adult male citizens were entitled to vote and to take part in government. Three important groups of citizens helped govern the republic: the Senate, the magistrates, and the assemblies.

- Textbook: Journey Across Time

1. Before 509 BCE, Rome had been ruled by a monarch. When the Romans overthrew their Etruscan king, they chose to set up a republic rather than a new monarchy of their own. Why do you think that they would have set up a republic? ___________________________________  
   ___________________________________
   ___________________________________

Document 6:

Civic Duty: “The willingness of the individual to subordinate himself or herself to the good of the community as a whole, a concept of fundamental importance to the Greeks, Romans, and Founders of our country.” —J. Rufus Fears

Roman Law gives you full membership in the Roman Empire. Every citizen was entitled to own land, participate in government, be treated equally under law. Every citizen was required to vote, sit on a jury, serve in the Roman Army.

1. What is a citizen of the Roman Republic required to do and is this similar to the civic duties of an American citizen? ___________________________________  
   ___________________________________
   ___________________________________
Many who rose to prominence in the Roman Republic were citizen-soldier-statesmen. The model leader was Cincinattus, who served as consul, then later as dictator. To the Romans, “dictator” was not necessarily a negative term; it meant a magistrate with extraordinary power who served the people and ruled on a temporary basis (no more than 6 months). Cincinattus was said to have come to the rescue of Rome twice in the fifth century B.C.E. during times of crisis. When those threats were put down, he promptly retired to his farm in spite of his great fame and potential power. As a result, the Republican government survived. The Roman military leaders who carried out their duties in the Republican Era served politically, then made way for others. Their society was vested in public service.

- Textbook: *Journey Across Time*

1. What does Cincinattus’ (and other such dictators’) willingness to give up power suggest about their opinions toward the ideal of a Republic?  

2. What American figure (who also was a farmer and a citizen-soldier-statesmen) had gained significant power only to give it up after heading an army: The Continental Army in the American War for Independence?
1. Using the document, explain how the government of the Roman Republic is different than the government of the U.S.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rome</th>
<th>US</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Executive</strong></td>
<td><strong>Executive</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Two consuls, elected by the assembly for one year-chief executive of the government and commanders-in-chief of the army</td>
<td>A president, elected by the people for four years-chief executive of the government and commander-in-chief of the army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Legislative</strong></td>
<td><strong>Legislative</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Senate of 300 members, chosen from aristocracy for life-controls foreign and financial policies, advises consuls.</td>
<td>Senate of 100 members, elected by the people for six-year terms makes laws, advises president on foreign policy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Centuriate Assembly, all citizen-soldiers are members for life-selects consuls, makes laws.</td>
<td>House of Representatives of 435 members, elected by the people for two years makes laws, originates revenue bills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tribal Assembly, citizens grouped according to where they live are members for life elects tribunes and makes laws.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Judicial</strong></td>
<td><strong>Judicial</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Praetors, eight judges chosen for one year by Centuriate Assembly two oversee civil and criminal courts (the others govern provinces).</td>
<td>Supreme Court, nine justices appointed for life by president highest court, hears civil and criminal appeals cases.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Legal Code</strong></td>
<td><strong>Legal Code</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twelve Tables- a list of rules that was the basis of Roman legal system</td>
<td>U.S. Constitution- basic law of the United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Citizenship</strong></td>
<td><strong>Citizenship</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All adult male landowners</td>
<td>All native-born or naturalized adults</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Lansdowne portrait of George Washing is full of symbolism, drawn from both American and ancient Roman symbols of the Roman Republic (http://www.georgewashington.si.edu).

The portrait has been divided into four quadrants as to assist you in analysis. Analyze each quadrant carefully making any annotations you wish before answer the questions that follow.

1. Identify the symbols of the Roman Republic depicted in the portrait.

______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________

2. Choose at least one symbol of the Roman Republic in the portrait and explain what you believe the artist was trying to convey to the American audience.

______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________

Artist: Gilbert Stuart
Year: 1796
Type: Oil on canvas
Dimensions: 243.8 cm × 152.4 cm (96.0 in × 60.0 in)
Location: National Portrait Gallery (United States)
Charles Mullett concluded that “Classical authors are to be counted among the ‘founding fathers.’ ... The heroes of Plutarch became the heroes of the revolutionary American leaders. Not less than the Washingtons and the Lees, the ancient heroes helped to found the independent American commonwealth.”


1. Who does Charles Mullett suggest, in addition to ‘the Washingtons and the Lees’ should be considered founding fathers? _________________________________________________________________

2. Why does Mullett make this argument? Do you agree?
   __________________________________________________________________________
   __________________________________________________________________________
   __________________________________________________________________________
In the following passages from John Adams work, A Defense of the Constitutions, Adams credits the Greek Historian Polybius with his vision of separation of powers.

“I wish to assemble together the opinions and reasonings of philosophers, politicians, and historians, who have taken the most extensive views of men and societies, whose characters are deservedly revered, and whose writings were in the contemplation of those who framed the American constitutions. It will not be contested that all these characters are united in Polybius.”

“The Roman constitution formed the noblest people and the greatest power that has ever existed. But if all the powers of the consuls, senate, and people had centered in a single assembly of the people, collectively or representatively, will any man pretend to believe that they would have been long free, or ever great?”

1. What does Adams credit the greatness of Rome and its government to?

______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________

2. Based on the passage, can you deduct that the ‘Founding Fathers’ such as John Adams were familiar with the classical forms of government? Why or why not?

______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________
______________________________________________________________________________